

# Online Appendix

## Can job search assistance improve the labour market integration of refugees? Evidence from a field experiment

Michele Battisti<sup>a</sup>, Yvonne Giesing<sup>b</sup>, Nadzeya Laurentsyeva<sup>c</sup>

This document includes four sections.

- Section A contains the text of our pre-analysis plan.
- Section B contains our survey questionnaires.
- Section C contains the consent form that was signed by our participants.
- Section D reports the text of the e-mail that was sent to participants after the initial job-counselling session.

---

<sup>a</sup>University of Glasgow and CESifo, Contact: michele.battisti@glg.ac.uk, University of Glasgow, Adam Smith Business School, Gilbert Scott Building, Glasgow, G12 8QQ

<sup>b</sup>Ifo Institute, LMU Munich and CESifo, Contact: giesing@ifo.de, Ifo Institute at the University of Munich, Poschingerstrasse 5, 81679 Munich

<sup>c</sup>CEPS and LMU Munich, Contact: Nadzeya.Laurentsyeva@ceps.eu, Centre for European Policy Studies, 1, Place du Congres, 1000, Brussels

## A Pre-analysis Plan

This section contains the text of our pre-analysis plan, including a discussion of the experimental setup, outcomes of interests and empirical methods involved. Before conducting our field experiment, we have uploaded this pre-analysis plan on the American Economic Association’s registry for Randomised Control Trials. To access it, please, click [here](#).

### A.1 Summary of the Project

We design a field experiment to evaluate the role of matching frictions on the employment prospects of refugees, and to shed light on the effects of employment on economic and social integration of refugees. During job-search training sessions taking place at refugee accommodation and other locations in and around Munich, we collect information from several hundred refugees that recently arrived in Munich and have (or are about to obtain) a work permit. All of our participants receive a complete CV in German. We then randomly allocate fifty percent of the refugees to our treatment group and fifty percent to our control group. The treatment group is then forwarded to an NGO that matches job candidates to suitable employers and supports the former through the placement process. We believe that this treatment can isolate the effect of matching and information frictions, while has not effect on the underlying skill set of refugees. The experimental setting allows to track both control and treatment groups over time. As a first stage, we analyse how successful the supported refugees are in obtaining interviews and job offers. If we were to find any treatment, we would also be able to discuss the possible mechanisms at work and attempt an evaluation of the treatment in a cost-benefit setting. We then use the treatment as an instrument for employment and focus on the integration outcomes of migrants, which we are able to measure through a panel survey. Our survey data include information on the background characteristics of refugees, their existing job-search strategies, and perceptions of integration.

### A.2 Experimental Set-Up

#### A.2.1 General Information about the partner NGO

To conduct the experiment we collaborate with a Munich-based NGO that assists job-seeking refugees. The NGO was founded in 2015 and currently counts 5 employees and about 20 part-time volunteers. It is financed through donations. The NGO conducts weekly resume preparation sessions in central Munich, consults job-seekers and recently employed refugees about basic legal and cultural specificities of the German labour market, and organizes a number of support activities, such as interview preparations, computer trainings, job fairs, or German conversation meet-ups. The NGO has established a network of local partners including the Federal Employment Agency, the Chamber of Commerce, other initiatives for refugees, and social workers. Through its network, the NGO receives information about open vacancies and, when applicable, forwards resumes of suitable refugees to employers. During the time of the experiment, our research group has participated in all regular resume preparation sessions of the NGO and has organized (on behalf of the NGO) a number of additional ones at different locations in and around Munich.

### A.2.2 Participants

The pool of potential participants in the experiment consists of job-seeking refugees who come to the resume preparation sessions of the NGO. In addition, several eligibility rules apply to ensure that the participants qualify to enter the German labour market. First, they have to possess a work permit. As a general rule, asylum-seekers obtain work permits three months after arrival in Germany. This excludes refugees from “safe origin countries” (Bosnia-Herzegovina, Macedonia, Serbia, Montenegro, Albania, Kosovo, Ghana, and Senegal). Consequently, the NGO cannot effectively support them in the job search. In rare cases, we still collect the data and prepare resumes for job-seekers from these countries, as these people qualify for unpaid volunteering jobs or schooling. However, we exclude them from our analysis.<sup>1</sup> Second, refugees in our sample must be able to communicate in a language spoken by the NGO’s or our research team members. These languages include Arabic, Dari, English, Farsi, French, German, Italian, and Russian and cover around 97 percent of the refugees that came to resume sessions.<sup>2</sup> Third, we work with the refugees who are at least 18 years old. The NGO does not include under-age refugees in its target group: there are more opportunities for them to attend an educational institution, and only refugees aged 18 or above are encouraged to integrate in the labour market. Besides, the age restriction is necessary for us to obtain the participation consent.<sup>3</sup> We are fully aware that these restrictions imply that our sample is not representative of the refugee population at large. We believe that this was to some extent unavoidable, given that we needed participants to voluntarily take part in the session and be willing and qualified to enter the German labour market.

### A.2.3 Time-Frame of the Experiment

The experiment comprises three stages: the resume preparation stage, the treatment stage, and the follow-up stage. The only difference between the control and treatment groups occurs during the second stage, when a randomly selected group of participants receives an additional job-matching treatment. The first two stages span over the period of six months (May-October 2016). The follow-up stage (the first follow-up survey) begins six months after the treatment has started (October/November 2016). We then intend to contact the participants every 6 months over the period of several years.<sup>4</sup>

#### First Stage: Resume Preparation

The first stage of the experiment consists of resume preparation sessions, which, during the time of the experiment, are jointly organized by the NGO and our research team. The regular sessions take place once a week in the centre of Munich. The participants can easily reach the location by public transportation. We have organized several additional sessions in a support centre for refugees (Caritas) and in big refugee camps in and around Munich. The NGO advertises the sessions through social workers, Facebook, word of mouth, and partner organisations (the flyer is in the Annex). The main incentives for

---

<sup>1</sup>At the time of writing, there is an active debate whether Algeria, Morocco, and Tunisia should be declared as “safe origin countries” or not. There is no political consensus yet and we have not excluded these nationalities. However, the number of refugees from these countries in Munich has been very small and so far none of our participants are nationals of any of these countries.

<sup>2</sup>So far, we have met five candidates, whom we had to send away because they only spoke Kurdish or Pashto. These were probably rather low educated refugees that would not have a good chance to integrate into the German labour market and who would need to focus on German classes first.

<sup>3</sup>To comply with the data protection laws of Bavaria, every participant needs to sign a data protection agreement (available in the Annex). Refugees below the age of 18 cannot legally sign the data protection agreement.

<sup>4</sup>The experimental design was approved by the Ethics commission of the Economics faculty of the University of Munich.

the refugees to come to these sessions is to receive a resume in German (that they can then forward to employers or to the job centre) as well as to acquire some information on their job-search process. During all the experimental sessions, the standard NGO's procedures apply.

During the resume preparation sessions, the interviewers (the NGO's volunteers and our research team) conduct one-to-one interviews with job-seeking refugees to collect the information needed to prepare their resumes. After collecting the resume data, the interviewers ask questions from a background survey to determine job-search behaviour, salary expectations, and job preferences of the participants. Additionally, we ask the participants about their family circumstances, their perceptions of integration, and their progress in studying German. In the end, the interviewer (in a separate form) evaluates participant's social skills. The complete resume form and survey can be found in the Annex.

In general, it takes the NGO around two weeks to process the collected information and to prepare the resume. The finished resumes include a participant's personal picture and photo copies of the work permit and certificates, if available. The NGO sends out the resumes to all the participants as a pdf attachment by e-mail two weeks after their sessions. If participants do not possess an e-mail address, the NGO sends it to them as a pdf attachment by WhatsApp and, additionally, to the responsible social worker. The standard message, which accompanies the resume, encourages the participants for active job search, includes several job-search tips, and advises to continue learning German. It also states that there is a chance that the NGO matches the participant with a possible employer. The complete message can be found in the Annex.

### **Second Stage: Treatment**

During the treatment stage, we randomly assign the participants to either the treatment or the control group. For the treatment group (50% of the participants), the NGO provides direct job matching assistance. The NGO can use job offers that it receives through its network.<sup>5</sup> In addition to the available offers, the NGO employees look for other vacancies that would fit the treated participants. Once the NGO identifies a potential match, it informs the participant about the vacancy and sends the resume to the employer. It is important to note, that while this intervention reduce the matching frictions between employers and job-seekers, it does not affect the skill set of participants in any way. Besides, both control and treated participants can take part in other activities organized by the NGO or, upon request, receive information support (for example, about the interview or the hiring process).

We randomize every two weeks, so that the NGO receives new resumes twice a month. In this way, we guarantee a stable flow for the NGO and ensure that the treatment starts at about the same time after the first meeting with the participants.<sup>6</sup> We generate a treatment and control group for each session separately, thereby insuring that for each session we have the same number of participants in the treatment and in the control group. For every session, a random number generator determines the treatment status. If the number of candidates is odd, the additional person is randomly allocated to the control or treatment group. As the sessions take place at different locations and time and individuals in the same session are more likely to be relatively similar, we believe that this procedure helps us in having people with similar characteristics in the treatment and in the control group, and therefore may provide a useful (albeit weak) stratification. People who attend the regular resume sessions are likely to differ from those who get interviewed directly in their camp; participants from different camps might have

---

<sup>5</sup>For each offer, the NGO employees look for qualifying participants from the treatment group and send the resumes of up to five participants to the employer.

<sup>6</sup>On average, every week we meet with 15 new job-seekers during the resume preparation sessions.

access to varying degrees of support services through local social workers; etc. Besides, it is logistically impossible to reach and to interview all potential participants within a short time span. This means that a randomisation of all candidates at once would not be feasible.

### **Third Stage: Follow-Up**

During the last stage, we intend to contact every participant to check their labour market status and to update our integration measures. This stage will include a series of follow-up surveys: tentatively, 6, 12, 18, and 24 months after treatment. Our research team will contact the candidates in person, by phone or alternatively by WhatsApp, Facebook messenger, E-mail or through an additional contact person they indicated. We will then conduct a follow-up survey of the employers to cross-validate the responses of the participants. Our goal is to attempt to be able to reach candidates although they moved away from Munich or from Germany, and are trying to collect all of the necessary information to make that possible. We also ensure funding to be able to cover our costs for the follow-up survey and to be able to incentivise participants, in order to avoid attrition (more on this below). The follow-up questionnaires are in the Annex.

## **A.3 Analysis**

The analysis is divided into two parts, one focusing on labour market outcomes and one on further integration and self-reported satisfaction outcomes. Below, we focus on each of the parts separately, emphasizing the effects where our treatment could have an impact. As very effectively discussed in Olken (2015)<sup>7</sup> that is intrinsic in projects like ours.

### **A.3.1 Labour Market Outcomes**

The hypothesis we would like to test here is simply whether participants in the treatment group have better labour market outcomes in the short (6 months) and medium (12-24 months) term compared to those in the control group. Evidence of positive effects would suggest that matching frictions between German employers and job-seeking refugees exist, and that the employment of refugees does not only depend on the skills they possess, but also on their possibility to be considered by employers who are trying to fill a vacancy. Overcoming these frictions may then facilitate labour market integration of refugees in Germany.

We consider two sets of variables. First, we look at a series of standard labour market outcomes, which can provide experimental evidence of a treatment effect. Second, we investigate a series of ancillary variables, which are useful to provide some (non-experimental) way of learning about the relative importance of different underlying mechanisms.

Main variables:

- Employed (at the point of the follow-up survey)
- Duration of employment (in months from the randomization day to the day of the follow-up survey)
- Wage (monthly (gross and net) wage at the point of the follow-up survey or in the last employment)

We define "employment" broadly as being in a paid job, internship, or vocational training. We might also consider each of the outcomes separately.

---

<sup>7</sup>Olken (2015), Promises and Perils of Pre-Analysis Plans, *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, Volume 29, Number 3, Pages 6180

Once the main effect is established, it is important to understand what drives the result. The treatment may modify the outcomes of the participants by 1) creating awareness of the job opportunity, 2) reducing the search time, 3) enhancing the quality of the match or 4) serving as a referral to the employer. Identifying the channel(s) is relevant for policy-making. We would also like to check for alternative mechanisms, i.e. whether the treatment (rather than or together with removing matching friction) modified the skills of participants, their knowledge of the local labour market, or job-search behaviour. This might happen through job interviews, for instance.

Supplementary variables

- Time until the first interview/trial/employment offer
- Number of job interviews for the first job (invited, happened)
- Number of job trials for the first job (invited, happened)
- Number of applications for the first job
- Where searched for vacancies (indicator variable as in the baseline survey)
- Job/skill match (an indicator variable: overqualified/ok/underqualified, based on observables, can measure for jobs they apply to and for the job they actually get)
- Self reported job satisfaction, self reported match quality
- Reservation wage (at the point of the follow-up)
- Difficulty in the job search (indicator variable as in the baseline survey)
- (Ask employers to see if they consider our treatment as a referral, if refugees contacted them directly)

### A.3.2 Integration Outcomes

The hypothesis we would like to test is whether earlier (better) employment leads to better integration outcomes in short- and medium-term. The treatment will serve as an instrumental variable for employment.

Main variables (measures of integration):

- Intention to stay (dummy variable)
- Knowledge of German language (indicator variable)
- Local acquaintances (dummy)
- Activities: study, sport, shopping, meeting with friends (total number)
- Feel at home (indicator on Likert scale)
- Integration index:  $\geq A2German + German\ friends + Invited + Activities + Feel\ home$
- Any other investment in human capital (as driving license)?
- Housing conditions

These outcomes directly correspond to questions in the follow-up survey. Because many of these questions are included in the initial (pre-treatment) survey as well, these variable can be analysed both in levels and in changes.<sup>8</sup>

---

<sup>8</sup>Clearly, because of the randomisation the two results should be identical, but adding pre-treatment levels as controls might lead to more precise estimates, which could be important given our limited sample size.

### **A.3.3 Network Effects**

Two measures of network: 1) proxy - address (camp) and nationality, 2) directly ask in the follow-up survey, if their friends participated in the NGO's resume sessions and if, yes, ask for the names.

Possible outcomes: spillovers within the network, sharing information about vacancies and referrals. This would allow us to evaluate the extent to which results depend on whether contacts/friends of the focal individual have been treated as well. In addition, this also allows us to evaluate the extent to which knowledge of a friend being treated has any effect.

### **A.3.4 Inclusion Rules**

All observations, for which we have resume information, pre- and post-treatment survey, will be included in the analysis. Participants who are not eligible for the experiment (see eligibility rules in section A.2.2) will be excluded from the analysis.

### **A.3.5 Statistical Model Specifications**

We will start by comparing the means between the treatment and the control groups as the treatment should be orthogonal to the covariates.

We will complement the analysis with OLS regressions with treatment as the main independent variable. Although these may be too demanding given our sample size, We will include some specifications in which we add location and time fixed effects to our regressions: as the entry into the experiment spans over several months and locations, we expect significant differences between the locations over time, which will lower precision of the unconditional estimates. The coefficient of the treatment variable will, hence, measure the "intention-to-treat" effect within a given location for a given time.

For medium-term labour market outcomes and integration results, we will estimate both "intention-to-treat" effects and LATE using the treatment variable as an instrument for (earlier) employment.

We then will perform heterogeneity analysis and robustness checks with covariates (education, years of work experience, region of origin), for which the balance tests indicates significant differences.

There might be an opportunity to merge our data with some data from the lab, where some of our Arab speaking candidates have participated in an experiment. We could potentially get measures of risk taking and time preferences. However it is not yet clear if enough people will be part of both studies so that a meaningful analysis is feasible.

We intend to cluster observations at the location and time level. We have conducted resume preparation sessions around six different locations: EWH, Kammerspiele, Gruenwald, Caritas, Bayernkaserne.

### **A.3.6 Balance tables**

We will present balance tables for the following variables: Country of origin (largest four countries or origin), months in Germany, family in Germany, years of education, years of work experience, date of job search start, previous contact with employer, received job offer previously, uses Internet in job search, has language difficulties in job search process, does not know where to search, level of German, currently in German class, integration index, return intention. These all correspond to questions in the pre-treatment survey.

### A.3.7 Heterogeneity

For both labour market and integration outcomes, there are several interesting dimensions of heterogeneity, which we intend to analyse. First, by nationality or by nationality group.<sup>9</sup> We might be able to analyse the countries with many refugees (Syria, Afghanistan and Nigeria) separately, while the rest of the countries can be grouped as other Arab countries, other Asian countries, other Sub-Saharan African Countries.

Another dimension of heterogeneity will be the level of education. Here, we can group people according to the schools attended and the highest school level completed (no school, primary completed and some secondary, secondary completed and some university, university completed).

Other interesting dimensions of heterogeneity will be age group, single refugees versus refugees that came with their family, asylum opportunities, and duration of stay in Germany.

## A.4 Limitations

### A.4.1 Selection

The refugees that are taking part in our experiment are not representative of all refugees living in Germany for several reasons: our eligibility criteria, their motivation to come to our sessions, and a focus on refugees residing in Munich. This selection has implications for external validity. An expansion of the Programme or a different setting might lead to different results. However, it does not impact the internal validity of the experiment as we randomize over equally selected participants.

The selection on the eligibility criteria is discussed in section A.2.2.

The second reason why our sample is selected is that the refugees that came to us are likely to be different from those who did not, and these differences may matter for most of the outcomes that we are interested in. One obvious difference is motivation. It takes extra effort to come to the resume advising sessions, especially to those that take place far away from where people live or go to school, and we expect our candidates to be positively selected on motivation. These highly motivated refugees should be also more motivated to learn German, search more intensively for a job, and to go to other support institutions. Other reasons for a selected sample might be educational background, social skills (some people may ‘shy’ away from our sessions), foreign language ability, or psychological well-being. Furthermore, in our way of reaching participants, we are focusing on refugees living in communal accommodation. By focusing on refugees living in communal accommodation, we exclude those that have the means to support themselves or who have already a network of family or friends. We thus focus on the ones most in need of support, which is the most policy-relevant group of refugees. This might actually induce some negative selection.

Third, the experiment only includes refugees that have been allocated to Munich and some of the surrounding municipalities. Refugees in Germany are allocated to federal states using the “Königsteiner Schlüssel”, which distributes refugees to states according to population size and economic conditions. However, it also takes the refugees’ nationality into account. This led to a slight over-representation of Afghan refugees in the case of Munich.

We can make a rough estimation of the percentage of all refugees in Munich that take part in our

---

<sup>9</sup>Given our sample size, it is unlikely that we will be able to get meaningful results if we analyse each individual country of origin separately.

experiment. There have been around 12,000 refugees in Munich at the end of 2015. If we restrict this to men of working age, then we have a pool of potential candidates of 6,000. Further subtracting refugees without a work permit and from safe countries of origin restricts the pool to around 5,000. We thus have a participation rate of around seven percent of relevant and eligible candidates in Munich.

Important for the external validity, particularity of the Munich labour market.

#### **A.4.2 Attrition**

In addition, we are aware that sample attrition could be high when working with this population. We concentrated our efforts on obtaining contact details that will not change over time. Besides obtaining their e-mail address and phone number, we also asked if we can contact them via What's App or Facebook. One positive element in this respect is that we provided everybody with some support (resume in German). The treatment group was rather easy to follow up with. As the NGO offers additional support activities, the control group also had an incentive to stay in touch with us. In addition, we manage to secure funding that will guarantee that we will be able to have financial incentives for individuals to participate in our follow-up surveys. Sample attrition may thus be lower than for a simple survey, where the individuals have no gain in remaining in the sample.

#### **A.4.3 Non-Compliance**

"Always-takers": As we were in close contact with the NGO they provided us with all refugees that they provided services to, also the refugees that contacted them without our intervention. Therefore, we will be able to be informed if any individual in our control group will approach the NGO and what will come of that additional context. The NGO did not provide the control group with job matching services during the time of the experiment.

"Never-takers": endogenously did not take it up (less benefit); exogenously moved to a different location (away from Munich)

#### **A.4.4 Displacement Effects**

One worry in labour market experiments is that participants of the treatment group obtain jobs that might have been filled by the control group in the absence of the experiment. If there is a limited number of jobs and both control and treatment group are competing for these jobs, then this is a valid concern. Crepon et al. (2013) find that displacement effects are particularly strong in labour markets with high unemployment. We think that displacement effects are of limited importance in the context of our experiment for two reasons. First, Munich has a very low unemployment rate and the 150 people in our treatment group seem very small compared to the size of the labour market and the number of vacancies in Munich. Second, most companies indicated that they would be willing to hire additional people if they have the required German and technical skills. So the amount of vacancies does not seem to be the limiting factor.

#### **A.4.5 Ethical concerns**

Doing experiments with a vulnerable group of people is a sensitive issue and we need to ensure that we do not harm anyone participating in our experiment. This is important for our institutions and for

the funding agencies involved. First and foremost, however, it is important to us. It is critical to make sure that people in the control group are not put in an unfair position and we do not deprive them from finding a job. We guarantee this in two ways. First, we collect many more resumes than the NGO could potentially match to the available vacancies. The NGO is newly established, has less than 10 full-time staff and thus limited capacity. We make sure that at any time they had more suitable resumes than open positions. Thus, they are already working at full capacity with the treatment group, and our control group would not have been able to additionally benefit from the services of the NGO. While this may limited our chances to find any effect, it ensures that the existence of our experiment does not negatively effect the overall number of matches that are created. Second, six months after the start of the treatment, we will make the resumes of all participants in the control group eligible for job matching. Through this phased-in design, we ensure that everyone receives the treatment in the end, timing being the only difference. Furthermore, we provide both the control and the treatment groups with a resume in German and valuable information on the job search in Munich and we communicate with both treatment and control group making it very clear that it is important that they search on their own. We also comply with the recommendations from the Ethics commission of the Faculty of Economics at the University of Munich.

To ensure that we follow data protection requirements of the Bavarian government and the university, we have a consent declaration of every participant that allows us to use their data for research purposes (see appendix B). This form is in accordance with Bavarian Data Protection Law. We treat the data in a pseudonymous way and make sure that no confidential data is distributed to third persons. In particular, we save the personal identification in a separate place and only merge it for the follow-up purposes.

## **B Survey Questionnaires**

Below, we include our survey questionnaires. We conducted the baseline survey in person during the first meeting with the participants (job-counseling session by the NGO). The follow-up surveys (after six and twelve months) were conducted over the phone. The version below is a rendering for the purposes of showing all questions that were available. The actual surveys were conducted using Google Forms.

## Baseline questionnaire for refugees looking for work

---

Applicant's ID: \_\_\_\_\_

Volunteer name: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

### Job search

1. When did you arrive in Germany ? \_\_\_\_\_

2. When did you start to look for a job in Germany?

After arrival  After getting the work permit  Not yet

3. How do you look for work? (up to 3 answers)

Arbeitsagentur  Internet  Social worker  Teacher  Asking employers/shops directly  Friends/relatives  Other \_\_\_\_\_

4. Have you registered at the Arbeitsagentur as looking for a job? Yes  No

4.1. When? \_\_\_\_\_

4.2. How many times were you there? \_\_\_\_\_

5. How many hours per week do you spend searching for a job?

0  1 – 4  5 – 8

9 – 12  > 12

6. What difficulties do you have during your job search? (up to 3 answers)

Language  Many rules  Don't know where to search  No suitable job

Missing skills  Job application  Other \_\_\_\_\_

7. Have you been in contact with a German employer? Yes  No

If yes, how?

Informal meeting  Job interview  Job offer  Work

Other \_\_\_\_\_

8. Have you already received one or more offers? (up to 3 answers) Yes  No

8.1. From whom?

Arbeitsagentur  Employer directly  From the camp/housing  Friends/relatives

Other \_\_\_\_\_

8.2. For what kind of work?

Full-time work  Part-time work  Internship

Other \_\_\_\_\_

9. Did you accept the offer? Yes  No

If not, why?

Low wage  Does not match your skills: too easy  too hard

Not full-time  Too far

Other \_\_\_\_\_

10. If you already had an internship/job in Germany, what were the reasons to leave it?

Contract is over  Small wage  Didn't like it  Moving location

Other \_\_\_\_\_

**Job expectations and interests**

1. **In which jobs would you like to work?** (up to 3 answers)

IT/Software Developer  Engineer  Construction worker  Cleaning services worker  Security  Bar/restaurant  Manufacturing  Administrative work  Personal care  Car mechanic  Sales person  Other

---

2. **Are there any jobs you would never do?** (up to 3 answers)

IT/Software Developer  Engineer  Construction worker  Cleaning services worker  Security  Bar/restaurant  Manufacturing  Administrative work  Personal care  Car mechanic  Sales person  Other

---

3. **What is the minimum monthly wage for you to accept a full time job offer?** \_\_\_\_\_

4. **The minimum monthly wage in Germany is about netto 1000 Euro per month. If it were dropped to 700 Euro, would you work for this wage?**

Yes  No

5. **Do you wish to get education or continue your education?**

University  School  Berufsausbildung (job training)  No

6. **Do you have experience being self-employed before arrival to Germany?** Yes  No

7. **Do you think you will be self-employed in Germany?** Yes  No

**Integration**

1. **Do you have family in Germany?** Yes  No
2. **Are you married?** Yes  No
3. **Is your husband/wife here in Germany?** Yes  No
- 3.1. Is he/she working in your home country? Yes  No
- 3.2. Is he/she looking for a job in Germany? Yes  No
4. **Can we contact him/her regarding job assistance?** Yes, at: \_\_\_\_\_ No
5. **In your family, who do you think should look for a job here in Germany in the future?**  
You only  Your partner only  You and your partner
6. **Do you have children?** Yes  No   
How many? \_\_\_\_\_  
In Germany? Yes  No   
How old are they? \_\_\_\_\_ years
8. **Are you planning for your wife and/or children to join you in Germany?** Yes  No
9. **What is the highest education of your father?**  
No school  Primary School  Secondary School  University
10. **Do you want to stay in Munich?** Yes, forever   
Yes, a few years  No   
Don't know
- 10.1. Would you move for work? Yes, within Germany   
Yes, within Europe  No   
Don't know
- 10.2. Do you want to return to your country once it is safe? Yes  No   
Don't know
11. **What was the main reason for choosing Germany as your destination as opposed to Italy, France or the UK? (up to 3 answers)**  
Relatives/friends  Jobs  Safety  Good reputation   
Asylum possibilities  Other \_\_\_\_\_
12. **Did you make new friends in Germany?** Yes  No
- 12.1. **Where are these people from?**  
Your country Yes  No   
Germany Yes  No   
Other country Yes  No
13. **You already feel at home in Germany**  
1 (Not at all)  2  3  4  5 (Completely)   
Yes  No
14. **Have you ever been invited to the house of a German?**
15. **What activities do you do outside of the GU?**  
Study/German  Sport  Shopping  Meeting with people  None  Other \_\_\_\_\_

16. Since coming to Germany, have you ever felt treated with less courtesy or respect because you are a refugee?

Never  Sometimes  Often  All the time

**Organisational details**

1. For how long have you learned German (in months)?

\_\_\_\_\_

2. Are you currently in a class?

Yes  No

2.1. If yes, where? Language school  Courses by volunteers  Other

\_\_\_\_\_

3. At what day and time is your class?

\_\_\_\_\_

4. How many hours per week do you learn German on your own?

\_\_\_\_\_

5. Do you have the certificate of your highest degree?

Yes, original  Yes, copy

No

6. Do you have a bank account set-up?

Yes  No

7. How did you hear about this session?

Internet  Flyer  Social worker  Friends

Teacher  Other \_\_\_\_\_

8. We would like to stay in touch and see how we can best support you in your job search. How can we best reach you?

Phone \_\_\_\_\_

What's app \_\_\_\_\_

E-Mail \_\_\_\_\_

Facebook \_\_\_\_\_

Phone number/E-mail address of friend or family member \_\_\_\_\_

## First follow-up questionnaire, six months after the baseline

---

Applicant's Name: \_\_\_\_\_  
Applicant's ID: \_\_\_\_\_  
Volunteer name: \_\_\_\_\_  
Gender: \_\_\_\_\_  
Date: \_\_\_\_\_

### Job search

1. Are you currently working? Yes  No  Not looking

#### Job search - not found

If no, continue here

2. Would you like to work? Yes  No

3. How do you look for work? (up to 3 answers)

Arbeitsagentur (employment office/job center)  Internet  Social worker   
Teacher  Asking employers/shops directly  Friends/relatives  Other \_\_\_\_\_

4. Have you registered at the Arbeitsagentur (employment office/job center) as looking for work? Yes  No

4.1. When? \_\_\_\_\_

4.2. How many times were you there? \_\_\_\_\_

5. How many hours per week do you spend searching for work? 0  1 – 4  5 – 8   
9 – 12  > 12

6. What difficulties do you have during your job search? (up to 3 answers)

Language  Many rules  Don't know where to search  No suitable job   
Missing skills  Job application  Other \_\_\_\_\_

7. Have you been in contact with a German employer? Yes  No

If yes, how?

Informal meeting  Job interview  Job offer  Work  Other \_\_\_\_\_

0  1 – 4  5 – 8

7. How many times did you send or give your CV to an employer?

9 – 12  > 12

Yes  No

8. Have you already received one or more offers? (up to 3 answers)

8.1. From whom?

Arbeitsagentur  Employer directly  From the camp/housing  Friends/relatives   
Other \_\_\_\_\_

8.2. For what kind of work?

Full-time work  Part-time work  Internship  Ausbildung/job training  Other \_\_\_\_\_

9. Did you accept the offer? Yes  No

If not, why?

Low wage  Does not match your skills: too easy  too hard

Not full-time  Too far

Other \_\_\_\_\_

---

**Job search - found**

If yes, continue here

1. **How did you find your work?** (up to 3 answers)

Arbeitsagentur  Internet  Social worker  Teacher/School  Asking employers/shops directly  SIR  Friends/relatives  Previous employer  Other

\_\_\_\_\_

2. **When did you start working?**

\_\_\_\_\_

3. **What is the name of the company?**

\_\_\_\_\_

3. **What is your position in the company?**

\_\_\_\_\_

4. **In which sector is the work?**

IT/Software Developer  Engineer  Construction worker  Cleaning services worker  Security  Bar/restaurant  Manufacturing  Administrative work  Personal care  Car mechanic  Sales person  Other

\_\_\_\_\_

5. **What type of work is it?**

Normal job  Mini-job (part-time, 1 E job) Internship  Ausbildung  Other

\_\_\_\_\_

6. **What is the net salary? (What you receive every months on your bank account)**

\_\_\_\_\_

7. **What is the gross salary? (Before tax and other deductions)**

\_\_\_\_\_

8. **For how long is the contract? (in months)**

\_\_\_\_\_

9. **How many hours do you work per week? (Full time is 40)**

\_\_\_\_\_

Yes  No

10. **Is the job too easy for you?**

11. **Which languages do you speak at work?**

German  English  Arabic  Other

12. **Are you the only refugee in your work place?**

Yes, the only one  No, one more  No, several  Don't know

13. **How happy are you with your colleagues?**

1 (Not at all)  2  3  4  5 (Completely)

---

14. **How happy are you with the salary?**

1 (Not at all)  2  3  4  5 (Completely)

15. **How happy are you with the tasks at work?**

1 (Not at all)  2  3  4  5 (Completely)

16. **How long does it take you to arrive at work (in minutes)?**

---

Yes  No

17. **Are you looking for better work?**

18. **Why did the work end?**

I quit  fired  contract ended  legal issues  other

---

### Not looking

If not looking, continue here

1. **Why are you not looking for work?** (up to 3 answers)

Studying German  In School  At university  Taking care of family  Medical reasons  net salary not high enough  Enough money  Uncertainty about asylum process  no work permit  Other \_\_\_\_\_

Yes  No

2. **Will you look for work in the future?**

2.1. If yes, when (date)

---

**Integration**

1. **Did someone from your family join you in Germany in the last six months?** Yes  No
2. **Do you want to stay in Munich?** Yes, forever   
Yes, a few years  No   
Don't know
- 2.1. **Would you move for work?** Yes, within Germany   
Yes, within Europe  No   
Don't know
- 2.2. **Do you want to return to your country once it is safe?** Yes  No   
Don't know   
Yes  No
3. **Did you make new friends in Germany?**
- 3.1. **Where are these people from?**
- Your country Yes  No   
Germany Yes  No   
Other country Yes  No
4. **Did the refugees you are in contact with find work**  
Yes, many  A few  One  No one
5. **Do you feel at home in Germany**  
1 (Not at all)  2  3  4  5 (Completely)
6. **How is your life now compared to 6 months ago?**  
Better  Worse  Same
6. **How will your life be in six months?**  
Better  Worse  Same
7. **Have you ever been invited to the house of a German?**  
Yes  No
8. **Do you still live at \*address from CV\*?**  
Yes  No
- 8.1 **If no, where do you live now?**  
apartment alone or with own family  apartment with flatmates  another  
GU/camp
- 8.2 **What is your new address?**
9. **What activities do you do outside of your house?**  
Study/German  Sport  Shopping  Meeting with people  None  Other \_\_\_\_\_
10. **Since coming to Germany, have you ever felt treated with less courtesy or respect because you are a refugee?**  
Never  Sometimes  Often  All the time

**Organisational details**

1. **For how long have you learned German (in months)?**

\_\_\_\_\_

2. **In Deutsch: Bist du gerade im Kurs?**

Yes  No

2.1. Welches Niveau? (A1, A2, B1, B2, C1)

\_\_\_\_\_

2.2. Wann und wieviel?

\_\_\_\_\_

2.1. Interviewer estimate (A1, A2, B1, B2, C1)

3. **How many hours per week do you learn German on your own?**

\_\_\_\_\_

Yes  No

4. **Did you already get your asylum decision?**

4.1. If yes, what is the outcome?

accepted for 3 years  accepted for 1 year  rejected but can stay  rejected and have to leave

4.1. When?

\_\_\_\_\_

5. **How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?**

5.1. **I am happy that I came to Germany.**

1 (Not at all)  2  3  4  5 (Completely)

5.3. **I will (still) be working in the next 6 months.**

1 (Not at all)  2  3  4  5 (Completely)

5.3. **Compared to what you expected, ist your life better, worse or as expected?**

Worse  equal  better

5.3. **What did you know about the life of a refugee in Germany before you came?**

Worse information  exact information  better information

5.6. **I need to focus on studying German before finding a job.**

Yes  No

5.7. **I had wrong information about Germany before I came.**

Yes  No

5.10. **What is the most important thing the German government could do to improve your situation?**

Facilitate family reunification  Faster asylum decision  Job finding support  Better German courses  Better housing  free movement  Other

\_\_\_\_\_

## Second follow-up questionnaire, 12 months after the baseline

---

**Applicant's Name:** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Applicant's ID:** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Volunteer name:** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Gender:** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Date:** \_\_\_\_\_

### Job history in Germany (to be completed by interviewer)

Fill with the available information from the baseline and follow-up surveys, double check with the participant. Then ask for the new information - what happened between the first and the second follow-up surveys.

Type	Start	End	Company name	Sector	Position	Why ended?
Full-time/Part-time				section 10, q.5		Quit/Fired
Internship						Contract ended
Ausbildung						Legal/Other

### Job search - found

Ask details about the current (or the last) job.

1. Still the same workplace \*name of company\* as during the last 6 months?  
 Yes  No

2. How did you find your new work? (up to 3 answers, can be skipped if the job is the same as in the first follow-up)

Arbeitsagentur  Internet  Social worker  Teacher/School  Asking employers/shops directly  SIR   
 Friends/relatives  Previous employer  Other \_\_\_\_\_

3. What is the net salary? (What do you receive every months on your bank account) \_\_\_\_\_

4. What is the gross salary? (Before tax and other deductions) \_\_\_\_\_

5. For how long is the contract? (in months) \_\_\_\_\_

6. How many hours do you work per week? (Full time is 40) \_\_\_\_\_

7. Is the job too easy for you?  
 Yes  No

8. Which languages do you speak at work?  
 German  English  Arabic  Other \_\_\_\_\_

**9. How happy are you with the salary?**

1 (Not at all)  2  3  4  5 (Completely)

**10. How happy are you with the tasks at work?**

1 (Not at all)  2  3  4  5 (Completely)

**11. Have you had another job in the last 6 months other than what you already mentioned?**

Yes  No

*If yes, repeat the above section*

**Job search**

*Only if still looking for work.*

**All the questions I will ask you now are only about the last 6 months!**

**1. Are you currently looking for a job? (or a better job if already employed)**

Yes  No  Not looking

**2. How do you look for work now? (up to 3 answers)**

Arbeitsagentur (employment office/job center)  Internet  Social worker  Teacher  Asking employers/shops directly  Friends/relatives  Other \_\_\_\_\_

**3. What difficulties do you have during your job search now? (up to 3 answers)**

Language  Many rules  Don't know where to search  No suitable job  Missing skills  Job application  No connections  Other \_\_\_\_\_

**4. How many job applications have you sent in the last 6 months? 0  1-4  5-8**

9-12  > 12

**5. In how many applications did you use the CV that we (SIR) sent you? 0  1-4  5-8  9-12**

> 12

**6. Have you been in contact with a German employer in the last 6 months?**

Yes  No

6.1 If yes, how?

Informal meeting  Job interview  Job offer  Work  Other \_\_\_\_\_

**7. Have you already received one or more offers in the last 6 months? (up to 3 answers) Yes  No**

7.1. From whom?

Arbeitsagentur  Employer directly  From the camp/housing  Friends/relatives  Other \_\_\_\_\_

7.2. For what kind of work?

Full-time work  Part-time work  Internship  Ausbildung/job training  Other \_\_\_\_\_

8. **Did you accept the offer?** Yes  No

If not, why?

Low wage  Does not match your skills: too easy  too hard  Not full-time  Too far  Legal issues  Other \_\_\_\_\_

**If not looking:**

**Why are you not looking for work?** (up to 3 answers)

Studying German  In School  At university  Taking care of family  Medical reasons  net salary not high enough  Enough money  Uncertainty about asylum process  No work permit  Other \_\_\_\_\_

**Integration**

1. **Do you want to return to your country once it is safe?** Yes  No  Don't know

2. **Did you make new friends in Germany in the last 6 months?** Yes  No

2.1. **Where are these people from?**

Your country: Yes  No

Germany: Yes  No

Other country: Yes  No

3. **Did the refugees you are currently in contact with find work in the last 6 months?**

Yes, many  A few  One  No one

4. **Do you feel at home in Germany?**

1 (Not at all)  2  3  4  5 (Completely)

5. **How is your life now compared to 6 months ago?**

Better  Same  Worse

6. **Have you ever been invited to the house of a German in the last 6 months?**

Yes  No

7. **Do you feel that you are now trusted and valued by the society here?**

Yes, definitely  Yes, a little bit  Not really  No, not at all

8. **What activities do you currently do outside of your house?**

Study/German  Sport  Shopping  Meeting with people  None  Other \_\_\_\_\_

9. **How would you rate your average stress level compared to 6 months ago? (Are you more worried**

now compared to 6 months ago)

Low  Normal  High

10. Have you felt treated with less respect or courtesy in the last 6 months just because you are a refugee?

No  Sometimes  Often  All the time

#### Organisational details

1. Do you still live in \*address from CV\*? Yes  No

1.1 If no, where do you live now?

Apartment alone or with own family  Apartment with flatmates  Another GU/camp

1.2 What is your new address?

2. Auf Deutsch: Wie gut ist dein Deutsch?

A1  A2  B1  B2  C1

3. Auf Deutsch: Bist du gerade im Kurs? Yes  No

4. How many hours per week do you learn German on your own? \_\_\_\_\_

5. What has helped you the most get to your current German level other than German course?

TV  Online german course (app or video)  Talking to friends  Work  Mentor  Religious activities  Sport activities

6. Did you already get your asylum decision? Yes  No

6.1. If yes, what is the outcome?

accepted for 3 years  accepted for 1 year  rejected but can stay and have work permit  rejected but can stay and does not have work permit  rejected and have to leave

6.1.1. When? \_\_\_\_\_

6.2 If no, how likely is it that your asylum application gets approved? (0-100%)

## C Consent Form

This section contains the text of the consent form, which was signed by all participants in our experiment. Individuals both signed a German and an English version. For individuals that did not know enough English or German to understand the text of the form, we provided translations in their mother tongue.

### Consent form, University of Munich

Researchers at the University of Munich (Giesing Yvonne, Nadzeya Laurentsyeva) and the Ifo Institute (Michele Battisti) are planning a research project to study the integration of refugees looking for a job in the German labour market. The purpose is to find out how refugees can be integrated into the labour market, which characteristics are especially important and how this impacts further integration.

The datasets that contain information about your CV and questions about integration in Germany are analysed in Munich in a pseudonymous form and information that allows personal reference will be stored separately for data security reasons. Only employees of the research team of the University of Munich and the Ifo Institute will have access to the data. The data will be saved on local files on computers of the LMU and the Ifo.

Your personal data is used only for this research project. It will not be passed to third parties for other purposes. As soon as the research purpose permits, the information that creates a personal reference will be anonymised or destroyed for data security reasons. The data is processed pseudonymously, so that no identification of individuals is possible. Anonymised and aggregated results will be published.

Your consent is voluntary. By withholding your consent you incur no disadvantages. You can revoke your consent for the future at any time and request deletion or destruction of your data.

I have received the information about the research project. I agree with the intended use of my data and currently have no further questions.

For questions I can write to [yvonne.giesing@econ.lmu.de](mailto:yvonne.giesing@econ.lmu.de)

---

Date, Place, Signature

## D Email sent to participants

This section contains the text of the e-mail that each participant received after the initial job-counselling meeting with the NGO. The e-mail below is identical for individuals in the treatment and in the control group. As attachment to the message below, every participant received a CV in German.

### Text of the E-Mail

Dear *NAME*,

Kindly find your German CV attached to this email.

There is a chance that we match you with a possible employer from our database. If we find an employer that is looking for someone with your qualifications, we will send your CV and they will contact you directly. While we do our best to support you in the job search, we cannot guarantee that we can find you a suitable employer, this is why we highly encourage you to keep searching for a job on your own. Here are some job search tips for you:

- Register at the Agentur für Arbeit The Agentur für Arbeit helps job seekers by providing advice and finding job vacancies.
- To register, you need to go there in person, once you have your work permit, and fill a form. Do not forget to take your ID (Ausweiss) and certificates if available!
- To get the address of the Agentur für Arbeit in your area, visit this link <https://www.muenchen.de/rathaus/dienstleistung> search for “Arbeitsvermittlung” and then give in your address.
- Please, visit their website for further information: [www.arbeitsagentur.de](http://www.arbeitsagentur.de)
- Use job search websites Many people in Germany find jobs online, so you can additionally look for jobs using websites like:
  - <http://www.monster.de>
  - <http://www.stepstone.de>
  - <http://www.jobpilot.de>
  - <http://www.jobboerse.de>
- Continue to learn German, as this will greatly improve your chances of finding a job

If you find an employer through your own search and need support in preparing for the interview or in understanding the contract, please, contact us at this email address (*e-mail address*) and we would be happy to assist you.

In order to be able to contact you regarding possible job vacancies and other activities, it is extremely important for us to have your updated contact details (e-mail, phone, and whatsapp number). Please, let us know as soon as you change any of your contact details.

Please also like our Facebook Page to stay updated about new events:

*Link to Facebook page*

If your friends are also looking for a job, please recommend them to meet us every Thursday 3-5pm at *address*.

We wish you good luck and best regards,

Your *NGO* Team